ENTANGLEMENT IN QUANTUM LIQUIDS & GASES

Understanding how quantum information is encoded in quantum matter



H. Barghathi UVM



E. Casiano-Diaz UVM UVM → IQC → Middlebury



P.-N. Roy

U Waterloo



R.G. Melko U Waterloo and Pl





Adrian **Del Maestro** University of Vermont



Quantum Entanglement





emergent spacetime



quantum matter





quantum technologies





Quantum liquids and gases

Theory: focused on systems with discrete Hilbert spaces with local degrees of freedom: qubits, insulating lattice models, ...

Experiments employ the quantum and itinerant positional states of ultra-cold atomic gasses and BECs



B. Lücke, *et.al.*, PRL 112, 155304 (2014)

boson sampling

C. Shen, et al., PRL 112, 050504 (2014)



ultra high-precision quantum interferometry

.Estève, *et al.*, Nature 455, 1216 (2008) Rényi entropy in lattice gases R. Islam, *et.al.*, Nature (2015)





multiparticle entanglement of trapped ions

T. Monz, *et.al.*, PRL 102, 040501 (2009)

How does quantum indistinguishability affect entanglement?



Can we use the entanglement in quantum fluids as a resource for information processing?





















 $S(\ell) \sim \ell^{\wedge}$ λ = ?

Entanglement and Entropy



quantifying uncertainty in many-body systems



Measuring Entanglement

SWAP algorithm in experiment and quantum Monte Carlo

Results for Quantum Liquids & Gases

benchmarking, scaling and the area law



Toy Quantum Matter

bosons with hard-cores on a 1d lattice



Investigate the quantum ground state for different interaction strengths V

What are the ground states?

 $V \gg 1$

$$T = -\sum_{i} \left(b_i^{\dagger} b_{i+1} + h.c. \right)$$

$$U = V \sum_{i} n_i n_{i+1}$$

 $V \ll 1$



solid

$$|\Phi\rangle = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}\left(|1010\rangle + |0101\rangle\right)$$



 $|\Psi\rangle = rac{1}{2} \left(|1010
angle + |0101
angle
ight) + rac{1}{2\sqrt{2}} \left(|1100
angle + |0011
angle + |1001
angle + |0110
angle
ight)$

A Quantum Bipartition

Break up the system into two parts and make a local measurement on $\bar{\mathsf{A}}$

Suppose we find:



what do we know about A?

 $V \gg 1$

no uncertainty = complete knowledge

 $V \ll 1$

uncertainty = incomplete knowledge

Entanglement quantum information that is encoded non-locally in the joint state of a system

•Can it be quantified?



•Can it be measured?



Quantifying Entanglement with Entropy

Entropy: A measure of encoded information

Entanglement: Non-locally encoded quantum information

Entanglement Entropy: A measure of entanglement



S(A) : how entangled are A and \overline{A}

Rényi Entanglement Entropies

An alternate measure of entanglement

$$S_{\alpha}(A) = \frac{1}{1-\alpha} \log \operatorname{Tr} \rho_{A}^{\alpha} \quad \Longrightarrow \quad \lim_{\alpha \to 1} S_{\alpha}(A) = -Tr \rho_{A} \log \rho_{A}$$

Rényi



How does quantum indistinguishability affect entanglement?



Bipartitions of identical particles

Different ways to partition ground state!

Mode Bipartition

Constructed from the Fock space of single-particle modes

$$|\Psi\rangle = \sum_{\boldsymbol{n}_{A}\boldsymbol{n}_{\bar{A}}} c_{\boldsymbol{n}_{A}\boldsymbol{n}_{\bar{A}}} |\boldsymbol{n}_{A}\rangle \otimes \langle \boldsymbol{n}_{\bar{A}}|$$

$$\rho_{A} \to S(A)$$

Particle Bipartition

Label a subset of *n* particles $n_A = n$

$$|\Psi\rangle = |\mathbf{r}_{1}, \dots, \mathbf{r}_{N}\rangle \qquad n_{B} = N - n$$

$$\rho_{n} = \int d\mathbf{r}_{n+1} \cdots d\mathbf{r}_{N} \langle \Psi | \rho | \Psi \rangle$$

$$\rho_{n} \to S(n)$$

Example: a simple quantum liquid I

► U/J

insulator

Α

1d Bose-Hubbard model

superfluid

$$H = -J \sum_{j} \left(b_{j}^{\dagger} b_{j+1} + b_{j+1}^{\dagger} b_{j} \right) + \frac{U}{2} \sum_{j} n_{j} \left(n_{j} - 1 \right)$$

example: L = 2, N = 2 spatial bipartition:

$$|\Psi\rangle = \alpha |20\rangle + \beta |11\rangle + \gamma |02\rangle$$

3.3

$$\rho_{A} = \operatorname{Tr}_{\bar{A}} \rho = \sum_{n=0}^{2} {}_{\bar{A}} \langle n | \Psi \rangle \langle \Psi | n \rangle_{\bar{A}} = \begin{pmatrix} |\alpha|^{2} & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & |\beta|^{2} & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & |\gamma|^{2} \end{pmatrix}$$

 $S_1(\rho_A) = -\operatorname{Tr} \rho_A \ln \rho_A = -|\alpha|^2 \ln |\alpha|^2 - |\beta|^2 \ln |\beta|^2 - |\gamma|^2 \ln |\gamma|^2$

Example: a simple quantum liquid II

► U/J

insulator

Α

1d Bose-Hubbard model

superfluid

 \bigcap

$$H = -J \sum_{j} \left(b_{j}^{\dagger} b_{j+1} + b_{j+1}^{\dagger} b_{j} \right) + \frac{U}{2} \sum_{j} n_{j} \left(n_{j} - 1 \right)$$

example: L = 2, N = 2 particle bipartition:

$$|\Psi\rangle = \alpha |1_1 2_1\rangle + \frac{\beta}{\sqrt{2}} (|1_1 2_2\rangle + |1_2 2_1\rangle) + \gamma |1_2 2_2\rangle$$

3.3

$$\rho_{1} = \sum_{i=1}^{2} \langle 2_{i} | \Psi \rangle \langle \Psi | 2_{i} \rangle = \begin{pmatrix} \alpha^{2} + \frac{\beta^{2}}{2} & \frac{\alpha^{*}\beta + \beta^{*}\gamma}{\sqrt{2}} \\ \frac{\alpha\beta^{*} + \beta\gamma^{*}}{\sqrt{2}} & \gamma^{2} + \frac{\beta^{2}}{2} \end{pmatrix}$$

Example: a simple quantum liquid III

1d Bose-Hubbard model

$$H = -J \sum_{j} \left(b_{j}^{\dagger} b_{j+1} + b_{j+1}^{\dagger} b_{j} \right) + \frac{U}{2} \sum_{j} n_{j} \left(n_{j} - 1 \right)$$



example: L = 2, N = 2

different bipartitions
can provide
complimentary
information on phases,
interactions & statistics



Can we use the entanglement in quantum fluids as a resource for information processing?

Or is it all just fluffy bunnies?

J. Dunningham, A. Rau, and K. Burnett, Science 307, 872 (2005)

Using entanglement as a resource requires ability to perform local physical operations on subsystems

Particle Entanglement

inaccessible due to the indistinguishability of particles

N. Killoran, M. Cramer, and M. B. Plenio, PRL 112, 150501 (2014)

Spatial Entanglement

particle number conservation prohibits swapping all entanglement to register

H. M. Wiseman and J. A. Vaccaro, PRL 91, 097902 (2003)

 $\widehat{SWAP}\left[\left(|1\rangle_{A}\otimes|1\rangle_{B}+|2\rangle_{A}\otimes|0\rangle_{B}+|0\rangle_{A}\otimes|2\rangle_{B}\right)\otimes|0\rangle_{reg}\right]$



N = 2, L = 4



 $X_1 = ?, X_2 = ?$

Operational entanglement

Get around these difficulties by combining the H. M. Wiseman and J. A.



H. M. Wiseman and J. A. Vaccaro, PRL 91, 097902 (2003)



Maximal amount of entanglement that can be produced between quantum registers by local operations.



Operational Entanglement Example

example:
$$L = 2$$
 $|\Psi\rangle = \alpha |20\rangle + \beta |11\rangle + \gamma |02\rangle$
 $A \bar{A}$
 $\rho = |\Psi\rangle \langle \Psi| = \begin{pmatrix} |\alpha|^2 & \alpha\beta^* & \alpha\gamma^* \\ \beta\alpha^* & |\beta|^2 & \beta\gamma^* \\ \gamma\alpha^* & \gamma\beta^* & |\gamma|^2 \end{pmatrix}$ $\rho_A = \operatorname{Tr}_{\bar{A}} \rho = \begin{pmatrix} |\alpha|^2 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & |\beta|^2 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & |\gamma|^2 \end{pmatrix}$
 $S_1^{\text{op}}(A) = \sum_n P_n S_1(A_n)$ $\rho_{A_n} = \frac{1}{P_n} \hat{P}_n \rho_A \hat{P}_n$
 $\rho_{A_2} = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 \end{pmatrix}$ $\rho_{A_1} = \begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 \end{pmatrix}$ $\rho_{A_0} = \begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 \end{pmatrix}$

 $S_1^{\rm op}(A)=0$

need at least 2 states in the subsystem

Experimental Measurement

Density matrix is generally inaccessible



Measurement becomes exponentially difficult! 4 particles on 4 sites: $\rho \sim 10^5$ entries

Entanglement and Entropy



quantifying uncertainty in many-body systems



Measuring Entanglement

SWAP algorithm in experiment and quantum Monte Carlo

Results for Quantum Liquids & Gases

benchmarking, scaling and the area law



The Replica Method

Computing Rényi entanglement entropies by swapping subregions between non-interacting identical copies

 $\alpha = 2 \rightarrow 2$ replicas of system

swap subregions

P. Calabrese and J. Cardy, J. Stat. Mech.: Theor. Exp. P06002 (2004)

Rényi entropies can be computed via local expectation values!



Experimental Measurement

C. Hong, Z. Ou, and L. Mandel, PRL 59 2044, (1987) A. J. Daley, H. Pichler, J. Schachenmayer, and P. Zoller, Phys. Rev. Lett. 109, 020505 (2012) R. Islam, R. Ma, P. M. Preiss, M. E. Tai, A. Lukin, M. Rispoli, and M. Greiner, Nature 528, 77 (2015)

IDEA: Use bosonic Hong-Ou-Mandel interference with atoms



Exact Diagonalization Results



R. Melko, C. Herdman, D. Iouchtchenko, P.-N. Roy and A.D. Phys. Rev. A, 93, 042336 (2016)

Exact Diagonalization Results



R. Melko, C. Herdman, D. Iouchtchenko, P.-N. Roy and A.D. Phys. Rev. A, 93, 042336 (2016)

Exact diagonalization is limited to small systems with discrete Hilbert spaces

Can We clet

Path Integral Ground State QMCDescription

$$\hat{H} = -\sum_{i=1}^{N} \frac{\hbar^2}{2m_i} \hat{\nabla}_i^2 + \sum_{i=1}^{N} \hat{\mathcal{V}}_i + \sum_{i < j} \hat{\mathcal{U}}_{ij}$$

N interacting particles in d-dimensions

Configurations

projecting a trial wavefunction to the ground state $|\Psi_0\rangle = \lim_{\tau \to \infty} e^{-\tau \hat{H}} |\Psi_T\rangle$

gives discrete imaginary time worldlines constructed from products of the short time propagator $G(\mathbf{R}, \mathbf{R}'; \Delta \tau) = \langle \mathbf{R} | e^{-\Delta \tau \hat{H}} | \mathbf{R}' \rangle$

Observables

exact method for computing ground state expectation values

$$O_{\tau} = \frac{\langle \Psi_{T} | e^{-\tau \hat{H}} \hat{O} e^{-\tau \hat{H}} | \Psi_{T} \rangle}{\langle \Psi_{T} | e^{-2\tau \hat{H}} | \Psi_{T} \rangle}$$



Updates

Local and non-local bead updates with weights given by $\pi(\mathbf{X})$

Porting the Replica Method to PIGS

Break paths at the center time slice τ , measure *SWAP* when replicas are linked via short time propagator G.



$\left\langle \widehat{SWAP} \right\rangle = \left\langle G\left(\boldsymbol{R}_{\tau} \otimes \boldsymbol{R}_{\tau}', \widehat{SWAP}\left[\boldsymbol{R}_{\tau+\Delta\tau} \otimes \boldsymbol{R}_{\tau+\Delta\tau}'\right]; \Delta\tau \right) \right\rangle$

Technology adapted from other QMC flavors

M. B. Hastings, I. González, A. B. Kallin, and R. G. Melko, PRL 104, 157201 (2010)
R. Melko, A. Kallin, and M. Hastings, PRB 82, 100409 (2010)
C. Herdman, R. Melko and A.D. Phys. Rev. B, 89, 140501 (2014)
C. M. Herdman, S. Inglis, P. N. Roy, R. G. Melko, and A.D., PRE 90, 013308 (2014)

T. Grover, Phys. Rev. Lett. 111, 130402 (2013)
Assaad, Lang, Toldin, Phys. Rev. B 89, 125121 (2014)
Broecker and Trebst, J. Stat. Mech. (2014) P08015
J. E. Drut and W. J. Porter, PRB 92, 125126 (2015)

Entanglement and Entropy



quantifying uncertainty in many-body systems



Measuring Entanglement

SWAP algorithm in experiment and quantum Monte Carlo

Results for Quantum Liquids & Gases

benchmarking, scaling and the area law



Benchmarking on a Solvable Model

Lieb-Liniger model of δ -function interacting bosons on a ring

$$H = -\frac{1}{2} \sum_{I=1}^{N} \frac{d^2}{dx^2} + g \sum_{i < j} \delta(x_i - x_j)$$







E. H. Lieb and W. Liniger, PR 130, 1605 (1963)
 C. M. Herdman, P. N. Roy, R. G. Melko, and A.D., PRB B 94, 064524 (2016)

Scaling of Spatial Entanglement

Expected scaling result for 1d critical systems:



J. Cardy and P. Calabrese, J. Stat. Mech. P04023. (2010) C. M. Herdman, P. N. Roy, R. G. Melko, and A.D., PRB B 94, 064524 (2016)

Particle Entanglement

Predicted general scaling form by Haque & Schoutens:

$$S(n,N) = \alpha \ln \binom{N}{n} + b$$

O. Zozulya, M. Haque, and K. Schoutens, PRA 78, 042326 (2008)M. Haque, O. S. Zozulya, and K. Schoutens, J. Phys. A 42, 504012 (2009)





Sensitivity of Entanglement to Statistics

spatial bipartition: **1d** critical systems

$$f_{\alpha}(\ell,L) = \frac{c}{6} \left(1 + \frac{1}{\alpha}\right) \log\left[\frac{L}{\pi}\sin\left(\frac{\pi\ell}{L}\right)\right] + c_{\alpha} + O\left(\frac{1}{\ell^{p_{\alpha}}}\right)$$

P. Calabrese and J. Cardy, J. Stat. Mech. P06002 (2004) J. Cardy and P. Calabrese, J. Stat. Mech. P04023. (2010)

particle bipartition:



$$S_{\alpha}(n, N) = a_{\alpha}(n) \ln \binom{N}{n} + b_{\alpha}(n) + \mathcal{O}\left(\frac{1}{N^{\gamma_{\alpha}(n)}}\right)$$

a = 1 for fermions
= n/K for 1d bosons

C. Herdman and A.D., Phys. Rev. B, 91, 184507 (2015)

H. Barghathi, E. Casiano-Diaz, and AD, JSTAT. 2017, 083108 (2017) M. Haque, O. S. Zozulya, and K. Schoutens, J. Phys. A 42, 504012 (2009)



 $S(\ell) \sim \ell^{\lambda}$

thermodynamic entropy is extensive $\Rightarrow \lambda = d$



entanglement area law?

Black Hole Entropy Area Law

Black hole thermodynamics:

• Quantum black holes emit thermal radiation

 $S_{BH} \propto area$

 Area Law: entropy of a black hole is proportional to surface area, not volume!





J.D. Bekenstein, *PRD* 7, 2333 (1973) S.W. Hawking, *Nature* 248, 30 (1974)

- Is this due to entanglement?
- Toy model: coupled harmonic oscillators
- Area Law: number of springs connecting A with A scales with boundary size



M. Srednicki Phys. Rev. Lett. **71**, 666 (1993)

General "Derivation" of the Area Law

Based on 2 physical principles:

 S(A) arises from correlations local to the entangling surface
 (d-1) surface

at scale r:
$$S(A, r) = \int_{\partial A} \frac{ds}{r^{d-1}} g(\partial A, r)$$

local quantity dependent

local quantity depending on curvature of ∂A

2. All length scales contribute: microscopic to macroscopic

$$S(A) = \int_{r_0}^{R} d(\log r)S(A, r) \qquad \text{spherical } \partial A \Rightarrow g = c_0 + c_1 \left(\frac{r}{R}\right)^2 + c_2 \left(\frac{r}{R}\right)^4$$

$$= \int_{r_0}^{R} \frac{dr}{r} \int_{\partial A} \frac{ds}{r^2} \left[c_0 + c_1 \left(\frac{r}{R}\right)^2 + \cdots \right]$$

$$= \frac{c_0}{2} \left(\frac{R}{r_0}\right)^2 + c_1 \log \frac{R}{r_0} + const. + O\left(\frac{1}{R^2}\right)$$

area law for a sphere!

$$M.B. \text{ Hastings, } J. Stat. Mech., P08024 (2007) S.N. Solodukhin, Phys. Lett. B, 693, 605 (2010) B. Swingle, arXiv:1010.4038 H. Liu and M. Mezai, JHEP 1304, 162 (2013) L. Hayward Sierens, Ph.D. Thesis, (2017)$$

What about a real quantum phase of matter?

helium-4



Entanglement in Superfluid 4He

3d box at T = 0 with periodic boundary conditions at SVP



Measure entanglement $S_2(R)$ between spherical region of radius R and the rest of the box



Investigate scaling by changing the radius of the sphere

C. M. Herdman, P.-N. Roy, R. G. Melko & A.D. Nature Phys 13, 556 (2017)

Scaling of the Entanglement



C. M. Herdman, P.-N. Roy, R. G. Melko & A.D. Nature Phys 13, 556 (2017)



C. M. Herdman, P.-N. Roy, R. G. Melko & A.D. Nature Phys 13, 556 (2017)

Entanglement in quantum liquids can be useful

Physical constraints determine the entanglement that can be transferred to a register for quantum information processing



Discovery of an area law in a real quantum liquid

Quantum entanglement scales with the surface area and not volume in superfluid ⁴He

$$S_2 \propto R^2$$

<u>http://delmaestro.org/adrian</u> • <u>http://code.delmaestro.org</u> • @agdelma

Partners in Research & Computing





XSEDE

Extreme Science and Engineering Discovery Environment



