FOUR REQUESTS from an Experimentalist to bold Theorists

Darrell G. Schlom

Department of Materials Science and Engineering Cornell University

Kavli Institute at Cornell for Nanoscale Science

My Four Requests

 Please do not Pollute the Literature with Predictions on Impossible Materials

Literature protocol:

Assume hypothetical structure, then predict (e.g, via DFT) an interesting properties.

But does the assumed structure have a chance to exist?



Prof. Alex Zunger University of Colorado Alex.zunger@colorado.edu

Exciting properties of impossible material

• **Optoelectronic** properties of 120 hypothetical ABX compounds (e.g. KCaN) were evaluated (literature) in assumed structures .We found (via DFT) most of these compounds would phase-separate into binaries.

• **Topolgical insulating** properties were predicted for LiHgAs, LiHgSb, NaHgAs etc (literature). We found these structures are thermodynamically unstable w.r.t. decomposition into binaries

Fermion quasiparticle in the SiO2- structure-type of BiO2.

• Harder-than-diamond cubic C3N4 proposed in literature (actually it is dynamically unstable in this crystal structure)

Global Space-Group Optimization (GSGO) Trimarchi & Zunger 2007 Phys Rev B)



Produce initial random generation, which becomes the parental population



Example of X-GSGO



Growth conditions



My Four Requests

- Please do not Pollute the Literature with Predictions on Impossible Materials
- Please do Consider the Limits of Synthesis

Important Synthesis Rules

Gibbs' Rule
 ΔG < 0 to form stable phases

• Matthias's Rules for Superconductors ... "Stay away from Theorists"

 Pauling's Rules for Crystal Structures Radius ratio criteria for stability

Rules for QM Synthesis

Gibbs' Rule
 ΔG < 0 to form stable phases

Matthias's Rules for Super unductors
 ... "Stay away from Theorists"

Pauling : Rules for Crystal Structures
 Radiu ratio criteria for stability



Gibbs' Rule ΔG < 0 to form stable phases





Gibbs' Rule ΔG < 0 to form stable phases Exploit interfacial energy from substrate

Substrates are Important

"Indeed, to achieve the objective of 'psuedomorphic stabilization,' the researcher should make the attempt to choose the substrate ..."



Epitaxial Stabilization



E.S. Machlin and P. Chaudhari, "Theory of 'Pseudomorphic Stabilization' of Metastable Phases in Thin Film Form," in *Synthesis and Properties of Metastable Phases*, edited by E.S. Machlin and T.J. Rowland (The Metallurgical Society of AIME, Warrendale, 1980), pp. 11-29.

Commercial Perovskite Substrates



BaRuO₃ Polymorphs





C.Q. Jin, J.S. Zhou, J.B. Goodenough, Q.Q. Liu, J.G. Zhao, L.X. Yang, Y. Yu, R.C. Yu, T. Katsura, A. Shatskiy, and E. Ito, "High-Pressure Synthesis of the Cubic Perovskite BaRuO₃ and Evolution of Ferromagnetism in $ARuO_3$ (A = Ca, Sr, Ba) Ruthenates," *PNAS* **105** (2008) 7115–7119.

Example – BaRuO₃ / SrTiO₃

- Epitaxially stabilized for ≤ 5 unit cells
- No octahedral rotations
 (2.5% compressive strain → tetragonal)







- Gibbs' Rule
 ΔG < 0 to form stable phases
 Exploit interfacial energy from substrate
- Matthias's Rules for Superconductors ... "Stay away from Theorists"

Rules of B. Matthias for discovering new superconductors

- high symmetry is best
 peaks in density of states are good
 stay away from <u>oxygen</u>
- 4. stay away from magnetism
 - 0

6. stay away from theorists

5. stay away from insulators



Scanned at the American Institute of Physics

From Steve Girvin's lecture (Boulder Summer School 2000) courtesy of Mike Norman via Matthew Fisher





Matthias' Rule

Team up with Theorists



Thin-Film Synthesis

Provide useful Feedback to Theory





Gibbs' Rule ΔG < 0 to form stable phases Exploit interfacial energy from substrate

Matthias's Rules for Superconductors

 "Stay away from Theorists"
 Team up with theorists
 (and provide them with useful feedback
 g., Thin-Film Synthesis + ARPES)

Why Thin-Film Synthesis + ARPES ?

"Artificial" Quantum Materials



Example—Hidden Phases of LuFe₂O₄

Spin Configurations



J.A. Mundy, C.M. Brooks, M.E. Holtz, J.A. Moyer, H. Das, A.F. Rébola, J.T. Heron, J.D. Clarkson, S.M. Disseler, Z. Liu, A. Farhan, R. Held, R. Hovden, E. Padgett, Q. Mao, H. Paik, R. Misra, L.F. Kourkoutis, E. Arenholz, A. Scholl, J.A. Borchers, W.D. Ratcliff, R. Ramesh, C.J. Fennie, P. Schiffer, D.A. Muller, and D.G. Schlom, *Nature* **537** (2016) 523–527.

MBE ≈ **Atomic Spray Painting**





Evolution of MBE



Ist MBE Al Cho at Bell Labs, 1972

Production MBE Today (courtesy of TRVV)



Ist University MBE Cornell, 1978



Oxide MBE + ARPES



Angle-Resolved Photoemission Spectroscopy (Kyle Shen)

GGM2RHEED I. MSE. CORNELL . B

MBE + ARPES

Titanates SrTiO₃ Sr₂TiO₄ LaTiO₃

Vanadates SrVO₃ LaVO₃ $SrVO_3$ / LaVO_3

Manganites $La_{1-x}Sr_{x}MnO_{3}$ SrMnO₃ $LaMnO_3$ / $SrMnO_3$

LaNiO₃ Cuprates $La_2CuO_4 T'$ $Sr_{1-x}La_{x}CuO_{2}$

Nickelates

Ruthenates RuO₂ SrRuO₂

Sr₂RuO₄ BaRuO₃ Ba₂RuO₄ CaRuO₃ Ca₂RuO $Pb_{2}Ru_{2}O_{6.5}$

Iridates IrO_{2} IrO_{2} / TiO_{2} SrIrO₃ Sr_2IrO_4 Ba₂IrO₄ Bi₂Ir₂O₇

Other Materials YbAl₃ LuAl₃ YbAl₃ / LuAl₃ BaBiO₃ BaSnO₃ BaPbO₃ FeSe



ARPES of BaRuO₃ / SrTiO₃



Quantum Well States in BaRuO₃

Thickness 3 unit cells



0.0

(0, 0)

Thickness 4 unit cells





Kyle Shen

- FM suppressed because of finite thickness?
- Or tetragonal distortion?

Thickness Dependence



How about Pyrochlores?



Weyl Semimetals

Substrate lattice (Å)



Pyrochlore Substrates





- Gibbs' Rule
 ΔG < 0 to form stable phases
 Exploit interfacial energy from substrate
- Matthias's Rules for Superconductors

 "Stay away from Theorists"
 Team up with theorists
 (and provide them with useful feedback)
- Pauling's Rules for Crystal Structures Radius ratio criteria for stability

Pauling's Rules

First rule: the radius ratio rule [edit]

For typical ionic solids, the cations are smaller than the anions, and each cation is surrounded by coordinated anions which form a polyhedron. The sum of the ionic radii determines the cation-anion distance, while the cation-anion radius ratio r_+/r_- (or r_c/r_a) determines the coordination number (C.N.) of the cation, as well as the shape of the coordinated polyhedron of anions.^{[3][4]}

For the coordination numbers and corresponding polyhedra in the table below, Pauling mathematically derived the *minimum* radius ratio for which the cation is in contact with the given number of anions (considering the ions as rigid spheres). If the cation is smaller, it will not be in contact with the anions which results in instability leading to a lower coordination number.

Polyhedron and minimum radius ratio for each coordination number

C.N.	Polyhedron	Radius ratio
3	triangular	0.155
4	tetrahedron	0.225
6	octahedron	0.414
7	capped octahedron	0.592
8	square antiprism (anticube)	0.645
8	cube	0.732
9	triaugmented triangular prism	0.732
12	cuboctahedron	1.00



Stability Limit

Stable

Unstable

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Pauling%27s_rules

L. Pauling, "The Principles Determining the Structure of Complex Ionic Crystals," J. Am. Chem. Soc. **51** (1929) 1010–1026.

A. Magnus, "Über chemische Komplexverbindungen," Z. Anorg. Allg. Chem. **124** (1922) 289–321.

BRRAK Pauling's Rules





https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Pauling%27s_rules

A. Magnus, "Über chemische Komplexverbindungen," Z. Anorg. Allg. Chem. **124** (1922) 289–321. L. Pauling, "The Principles Determining the Structure of Complex Ionic Crystals," J. Am. Chem. Soc. **51** (1929) 1010–1026.

Strained SrTiO₃—Transmuting a Dielectric into a Ferroelectric



Straineg SrTiO₃—Transmuting a Dielectric into a Ferroelectric

Straineg EuTiO₃-Strongest Ferromagnetic Ferroelectric

Shown are the exchange constants (J) calculated between the Eu ions within the unconstrained bulk I4/mcm ETO and the ETO film on LSAT with ($a^0a^0c^-$) structure under -0.9% compressive strain, including the first, second and third NN Eu ions describing both the in-plane (xy) and out-of-plane (z) interactions. Positive indicates FM and negative AFM coupling. The second row indicates the number of neighbours for each particular interaction. The first and second NN interactions are mostly FM bar the first NN out-of-plane J_{12} exchange constant. The calculations indicate the importance of J_3 in determining the G-AFM structure in ETO.

Straineg EuTiO₃-Strongest Ferromagnetic Ferroelectric

(a boring dielectric)

commensurately)

J.H. Lee, L. Fang, E. Vlahos, X. Ke, Y.W. Jung, L.F. Kourkoutis, J-W. Kim, P.J. Ryan, T. Heeg, M. Roeckerath, V. Goian, M. Bernhagen, R. Uecker, P.C. Hammel, K.M. Rabe, S. Kamba, J. Schubert, J.W. Freeland, D.A. Muller, C.J. Fennie, P. Schiffer, V. Gopalan, E. Johnston-Halperin, and D.G. Schlom, Nature 466 (2010) 954-958.

Commercial Perovskite Substrates

Effect of Strain on Sr₂RuO₄ (a spin-triplet superconductor)

 \rightarrow apply negative pressure

In-plane Uniaxial Strain Dramatically Increases T_c in Sr₂RuO₄

enhancements in T_c may be tied to proximity of van Hove singularity to E_F , but strains that can be applied to single crystal Sr_2RuO_4 are relatively modest ($\leq 0.8\%$; $T_{c,max}$ of 3.4 K at 0.6% uniaxial compressive strain)

C.W. Hicks, D.O. Brodsky, E.A. Yelland, A.S. Gibbs, J.A.N. Bruin, M.E. Barber, S.D. Edkins, K. Nishimura, S. Yonezawa, Y. Maeno, and A.P. Mackenzie, *Science* **344** (2014) 283–285.

+ arXiv:1604.06669

Much Larger Elastic Strains are Possible in Epitaxial Thin Films

In-Plane Lattice Constant (Å)

Strain Control of Fermi Surface in Sr₂RuO₄

Unstrained Sr₂RuO₄

Sr_2RuO_4 on $SrTiO_3$ (+0.9%)

thin films still non-superconducting due to extreme sensitivity of spin-triplet SC to disorder, but low resistivities (5 $\mu\Omega$ ·cm)

Pushing to Higher "strains" using Epitaxial Stabilization of Ba₂RuO₄

In-Plane Lattice Constant (Å)

• Ba₂RuO₄ is isoelectronic and isostructural to Sr₂RuO₄

• Metastable in bulk, but can be epitaxially stabilized

Strain Control of Fermi Surface in Sr₂RuO₄

Unstrained Sr₂RuO₄

Large epitaxial strains turn the large electron-like Fermi surface closed around Γ to a hole-like Fermi surface closed around X

Strain Control of Band Structure and van Hove singularity

Theory Predicts Enhancement of Spin-triplet Superconductivity

Eun-Ah Kim

Craig Fennie

Spin-triplet superconductivity is predicted to be strongly enhanced when the van Hove singularity is brought near the Fermi level (see arXiv:1604.06661)

Imagine Tuning Quantum Materials

Independent Control of

- Strain
- Doping
- Octahedral **Rotations**
- Proximity **Effects**
- Electron Overla (Kinetic Energy) **Dimensionality**

Carrier Density With ability to see changes in electronic structure

Rules for QM Synthesis

Gibbs' Rule
 ΔG < 0 to form stable phases

Matthias's Rules for Super unductors
 ... "Stay away from Theorists"

Pauling : Rules for Crystal Structures
 Radiu ratio criteria for stability

My Four Requests

- Please do *not* Pollute the Literature with Predictions on Impossible Materials
- Please do Consider the Limits of Synthesis
- Please do use the new NSF-MIP National User Facilities (PARADIM + 2DCC)

Materials Genome Initiative

Enabling the discovery, development, manufacturing, and deployment of advanced materials at least twice as fast as possible today, at a fraction of the cost.

• Webinars, Workshops, Website resources

mip.psu.edu

Partnership opportunities with PUI, MSI

Broad access to compelling synthetic tools with integrated theory support

2D chalcogenide monolayers, surfaces and interfaces are emerging as a compelling class of systems with transformative new science that can be harnessed for novel device technologies in next-generation electronics.

An NSF user facility with broad access:

- Open calls for user proposals,
- No user fees for academic use
- Access to a team of local experts
- Community knowledge-base of synthetic protocols

New \$25 Million National User Facility to help YOU BREAK THE RULES! for FREE

Bulk

Thin Film

New Chemistry New Physics New Materials Science New Materials

ence S

Theory & Computation

Electron Microscopy Characterization

Bulk Crystal Growth User Facility

Expanded Growth Conditions

P = 300 atm (first in world) Supercritical fluids

(first FeSc₂S₄ crystals)

Routine, in situ Growth Guidance

X-ray CT and Laue

Identify origin of

defect structures

Vapor Equilibria

Tyrel McQueen

Thin Film User Facility (opens 2017)

Expanded Growth Conditions

Any 11 of **62 elements** by MBE at one time (and refills without breaking chamber vacuum) $T_{sub} < 1400 \text{ °C}$ Many others (e.g., chalcogenides) via MOCVD

tLaCePrNdPmSmEuGdTbDyHoErTmYbLu‡AcThPaUNpPuAmCmBkCfEsFmMdNoLr

RADIM

Jiwoong Park

Routine, in situ Growth and Characterization

Muller, Park, Nature 520 (2015) 656.

Electron Microscopy User Facility

FEI T12 TEM

Imaging grains in 2D materials

EEI E20 nonochromated S/TEM

Atomic resolution Imaging

Kourkoutis, Song, Hwang, Muller,

PNAS 107 (2010) 11682

2 nm

First 5th order aberration corrected STEM

Probe Corrected FEI Titan Themis cryoST *First of its kind cryoSTEM*

Ш

Atomic resolution
 imaging + spectroscopic
 mapping at LN₂ temp.

 Magnetic imaging by Lorentz TEM

NSD

Atomic resolution Elemental Mapping

Muller, Kourkoutis, Murfitt, Song, Hwang, Silcox, Dellby, Krivanek, *Science* **319** (2008) 1073

Electron Microscopy for Materials Characterization at the Atomic Scale

Tools for:

Chemical Imaging

Science **319**, 1073 (2008).

Seeing Every Atom

Nano Lett. **12**, 1081 (2012)

Physical Properties

Microsc. and Microanal. **22**, 237 (2016)

Theory User Facility

Helping to close the gap with experiment

Two modes of operation

Consultation—Advise and Help	Collaboration—coauthoring
Key elements: • Fundamental theory • Well-known Algorithms • Software packages	 Key elements: Advanced/new theory Advanced/new Algorithms Specialty Software packages
 Efficiency techniques Aided by: Materials-by-Design Toolbox Community On-Line Short Courses Open-source code Databases Tutorials 	 Runtime optimization Aided by: Materials-by-Design Toolbox Community Databases Commercial codes Specialized codes Code modifications
• Written instructions $A P A \Box I \Lambda A$	INST INST

PARADIM – A National User Facility

- Theory to help guide experiment
- High-pressure (supercritical fluid) floating-zone growth
- Mass spectrometry and computed tomography *during* bulk crystal growth
- Integrated MOCVD + MBE + ARPES
- High sensitivity, high dynamic range pixel array detector for quantitative mapping of *E* and *B* fields with sub-nm resolution
- Stable cryo-stages for STEM and STEM-EELS at 20 K and 80-1200 K

FREE to the academic community via 2-page proposals

Summer Schools to build a community of practitioners Electron Microscopy, June 18th-23th, 2017 Crystal Growth and Design, July 16th-21th, 2017 MARADIM http://paradim.cornell.edu

My Four Requests

- Please do *not* Pollute the Literature with Predictions on Impossible Materials
- Please do Consider the Limits of Synthesis
- Please do use the new NSF-MIP National User Facilities (PARADIM + 2DCC)
- Please do Tell me First if you Predict a Materials-Specific Embodiment of a Room-Temperature Superconductor